

This record is a partial extract of the original cable. The full text of the original cable is not available.

UNCLAS SECTION 01 OF 02 VATICAN 004241

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

DEPT FOR EUR/WE (MENNUTI)

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: KSCA PREL AORC TBIO TPHY KSCA PREL AORC TBIO TPHY VT UNGA VTUNGA

SUBJECT: VATICAN ON CLONING CONVENTION: DON'T MAKE THE IDEAL THE ENEMY OF THE GOOD

REF: STATE 160115

¶1. (SBU) SUMMARY: VATICAN DFM MIGLIORE TOLD DCM AUGUST 30 THAT THE HOLY SEE SHARED U.S. GOALS ON THE CLONING CONVENTION AND SUPPORTED USG EFFORTS TO ACHIEVE A UN CONVENTION TO BAN ALL FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING. HOWEVER, THE VATICAN FEARED THAT UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 VATICA 04241 01 OF 02 030554Z  
PRESSING TOO HARD FOR A COMPREHENSIVE BAN NOW MIGHT LEAD TO A MISSED OPPORTUNITY TO ACHIEVE A GLOBAL BAN ON HUMAN CLONING THAT THE HOLY SEE REGARDS AS FUNDAMENTAL. THE HOLY SEE IS PREPARED TO WORK WITH THE U.S. IN THE LEAD UP TO THE UNGA IN PURSUIT OF A TOTAL BAN, AND MIGLIORE TOOK ON BOARD THE NAMES OF THE COUNTRIES WHICH REFTEL RECOMMENDS THEY APPROACH. NEVERTHELESS, THE HOLY SEE IS PREPARED TO PURSUE AN ALTERNATIVE APPROACH IF IT APPEARS THAT A COMPREHENSIVE BAN IS IMPOSSIBLE TO ACHIEVE. THE ALTERNATIVE WOULD DELETE THE LANGUAGE IN THE CURRENT DRAFT UN RESOLUTION THAT LEAVES OPEN OTHER HUMAN CLONING ACTIVITIES, WHILE RETAINING EXPLICIT REFERENCES TO THE INTENT TO MOVE AFTER PHASE ONE (REPRODUCTIVE CLONING) TO A PHASE TWO THAT WOULD BAN ALL OTHER FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING. THE HOLY SEE BELIEVES THIS WOULD ESTABLISH THE PRINCIPLE THAT ALL FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING ARE CURRENTLY REGARDED AS "UNACCEPTABLE." END SUMMARY.

¶2. (SBU) DCM PRESENTED REFTEL REQUEST TO VATICAN DFM CELESTINO MIGLIORE ON AUGUST 30. MIGLIORE INDICATED HE HAD HEARD FROM THE HOLY SEE'S PERMANENT OBSERVER MISSION IN NEW YORK ABOUT THE U.S. APPROACH, AND CAUTIONED THAT THE U.S. MIGHT BE TOO AMBITIOUS. HE SAID THAT THE HOLY SEE FULLY SUPPORTED US EFFORTS TO ACHIEVE A COMPREHENSIVE BAN ON HUMAN CLONING BECAUSE WE SHARE THE SAME STRONG MORAL CONCERNS. HE FEARED, HOWEVER, THAT IT WOULD PROVE IMPOSSIBLE TO GENERATE THE VOTES AT THIS TIME TO AUTHORIZE A CONVENTION ON A COMPREHENSIVE BAN ON HUMAN CLONING. IN THIS CASE, THE HOLY SEE BELIEVED IT COULD PROVE IMPOSSIBLE TO REGAIN THE MOMENTUM FOR SUCH A BAN IN THE FUTURE, AND THE MOMENT TO ACHIEVE A BAN ON HUMAN CLONING COULD PASS. MIGLIORE PREFERRED TO PRESS NOW FOR THE PHASE ONE BAN AS PROPOSED BY THE FRENCH AND GERMANS UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 VATICA 04241 01 OF 02 030554Z  
BUT WITH CHANGED LANGUAGE IN THE AUTHORIZING RESOLUTION.

¶3. (SBU) WHILE THE HOLY SEE AGREED THAT THE TWO PHASE APPROACH CARRIED RISKS, THEY HAD DEVELOPED AN ALTERNATIVE TO THE FRENCH AND GERMAN PROPOSAL THAT THEY BELIEVED COULD ESTABLISH THE PRINCIPLE AGAINST ALL FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING, WHILE LOCKING IN A COMMITMENT TO NEGOTIATIONS ON THE SECOND STEP. SPECIFICALLY, THE HOLY SEE WOULD PROPOSE DELETING OP 3(B), WHICH HE PARAPHRASED AS READING: "THE SOCIAL COMMITTEE CLARIFIES THAT A BAN ON HUMAN REPRODUCTIVE CLONING IS NOT TO PREJUDICE THE LEGALITY OR ILLEGALITY OF OTHER HUMAN CLONING ACTIVITIES." THIS DELETION, COMBINED WITH EXISTING LANGUAGE FURTHER DOWN IN THE RESOLUTION EXPLICITLY CALLING FOR BOTH A BAN ON REPRODUCTIVE CLONING AND A SUBSEQUENT CONVENTION BANNING ALL OTHER FORMS OF HUMAN CLONING WOULD ESTABLISH THE PRINCIPLE THAT ANY FORM OF HUMAN CLONING WAS "INADMISSIBLE" WHILE OFFERING A WAY TO MOVE FORWARD NOW, MIGLIORE MAINTAINED.

¶4. (SBU) DCM ASSURED MIGLIORE THAT THE USG APPRECIATED THE HOLY SEE'S DESIRE TO LOCK IN THE PRINCIPLE BANNING HUMAN REPRODUCTIVE CLONING IN THE EVENT A COMPREHENSIVE BAN APPEARED UNATTAINABLE. HE REITERATED THAT AT THIS POINT, HOWEVER, THE US BELIEVED IT WAS POSSIBLE TO BUILD CONSENSUS FOR THE CONVENTION ON A COMPREHENSIVE BAN AND INTENDED TO WORK HARD TO BUILD A COALITION TO THAT END. DCM PRESSED MIGLIORE TO JOIN US NOW IN PURSUIT OF A COMPREHENSIVE BAN, WHILE KEEPING THEIR ALTERNATIVE APPROACH IN RESERVE FOR THE TIME BEING. MIGLIORE INDICATED THE HOLY SEE WOULD WORK WITH

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED PTQ4886

PAGE 01 VATICA 04241 02 OF 02 030555Z  
ACTION EUR-00

INFO LOG-00 NP-00 AF-00 ACQ-00 CIAE-00 USNW-00 DODE-00  
WHA-00 DS-00 EAP-00 UTED-00 VC-00 HHS-01 TEDE-00

INR-00 IO-00 VCE-00 NSAE-00 OES-01 OIC-02 PER-00  
SSO-00 SS-00 TEST-00 DSCC-00 NFAT-00 SAS-00 /004W  
-----E174A4 030555Z /38

O 030536Z SEP 02  
FM AMEMBASSY VATICAN  
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE  
INFO AMEMBASSY ABIDJAN PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY BELIZE PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY BOGOTA PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY CARACAS PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY GUATEMALA PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY HARARE PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY LA PAZ PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY LIMA PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY MADRID PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY MANILA PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY MEXICO PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY MONTEVIDEO PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY PRETORIA PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY QUITO PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY ROME PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY SAN JOSE PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY SAN SALVADOR PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY SANTIAGO PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY SANTO DOMINGO PRIORITY  
AMEMBASSY WARSAW PRIORITY  
USINT HAVANA PRIORITY  
USMISSION USUN NEW YORK PRIORITY

UNCLAS SECTION 02 OF 02 VATICAN 004241

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

DEPT FOR EUR/WE (MENNUTI)

E.O. 12958: N/A  
TAGS: [KSCA](#) [PREL](#) [AORC](#) [TBIO](#) [TPHY](#) [KSCA](#) [PREL](#) [AORC](#) [TBIO](#) [TPHY](#) [VT](#) [UNGA](#) [VTUNGA](#)  
SUBJECT: VATICAN ON CLONING CONVENTION: DON'T MAKE THE  
IDEAL THE ENEMY OF THE GOOD

THE U.S. IN THIS FASHION, AND TOOK NOTE OF THE FIVE COUNTRIES  
MENTIONED REFTEL AS LIKELY TO BE OPEN TO HOLY SEE INFLUENCE.  
STILL, HE REITERATED THAT THE HOLY SEE WOULD WANT TO PRESS  
FOR ITS ALTERNATIVE LANGUAGE IF AND WHEN IT SAW THAT  
CONSENSUS WAS BECOMING TOO HARD TO ACHIEVE.

[15.](#) (SBU) COMMENT: THE HOLY SEE'S CAUTION ON AN ISSUE THAT  
UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 VATICAN 04241 02 OF 02 030555Z  
GOES TO THE CORE OF ITS MISSION WAS SURPRISING, PARTICULARLY  
WITH POWERFUL ALLIES IN THE USG AND OTHER COUNTRIES THAT  
SUPPORT A CONVENTION ADDRESSING A COMPREHENSIVE BAN. IN THIS  
CASE, THE CAUTION REFLECTS NOT ONLY THE HOLY SEE'S  
PRAGMATISM, BUT ALSO THE EXTREME IMPORTANCE THE HOLY SEE  
ATTACHES TO A BAN ON HUMAN REPRODUCTIVE CLONING AND DESIRE TO  
ACHIEVE AGREEMENT ON SUCH A BAN. WE ARE CONFIDENT THE HOLY SEE  
WILL ENCOURAGE ITS UN OBSERVER IN NEW YORK AND NUNCIOS IN  
POLAND, THE PHILIPPINES, HONDURAS, ZIMBABWE, AND IVORY COAST  
TO APPROACH THE HOST GOVERNMENTS TO SEEK OUT SUPPORT FOR OUR  
APPROACH TO THE ISSUE, AND MIGLIORE HAS AGREED TO UPDATE US  
ON THEIR DISCUSSIONS. WITH THEIR FINGER TO THE WIND,  
HOWEVER, THEY WILL TURN TO THEIR COMPROMISE IF THEY DEEM IT  
NECESSARY PRESERVE THE CHANCE FOR A FUTURE GLOBAL BAN.

NICHOLSON  
SKODON

UNCLASSIFIED

>

2002VATICAN04241 - Classification: UNCLASSIFIED